

FINAL MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

September 6, 2006, 10:00 a.m.

Halsey Lecture Hall - Virginia Historical Society
428 North Boulevard, Richmond, Virginia 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Carl Lounsbury, Vice-Chair
Ann Alexander
Lauranett Lee
Elizabeth Moore

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Addison Thompson, Chair
Patrick Butler, Vice-Chair
John Braymer
Jeanne Evans
Ora McCoy
Helen Murphy

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Catherine Slusser, Deputy Director
Ann Andrus
Francine Archer
Camille Bowman
Bob Carter
David Edwards
Joanie Evans
Randy Jones

Jean McRae
Chris Novelli
Olga Skorackyj
Susan Smead
Kelly Spradley-Kurowski
Chris Stevenson
Elizabeth Tune
Marc Wagner

State Review Board (SRB)

Vice-Chair Lounsbury called the State Review Board meeting to order shortly after 10:00 a.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He read the role of the board, asked the other members to introduce themselves, and then explained the process of registration.

The minutes from the June 8, 2006 meeting were approved with a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Ms. Lee. Under new business, Vice-Chair Lounsbury asked for a vote on the 2007 meeting dates. With a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Ms. Lee, the dates of March 7, June 6, September 5, and December 5 were approved. There was no old business.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Thompson called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board then asked each member to introduce themselves.

The minutes from the June 8, 2006 meeting were approved with a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Ms. Murphy. Under new business, Chair Thompson asked for a vote on the 2007 meeting dates. With a motion from Mr. Butler and a second from Mr. Braymer, the dates of March 7, June 6, September 5, and December 5 were approved. There was no old business.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance, congratulated Mr. Thompson and Mr. Butler on their reappointment to the HRB, and introduced Ms. Luranett Lee, Ph.D. and Ms. Elizabeth Moore, Ph.D. as new members to the SRB.

Director Kilpatrick spoke of Virginia's status at #1 in historic districts listed with the National Park Service in 2005 and #2 for individual nominations. She asked for the Board's support on the state work plan, and updated the Boards on legislative and environmental review issues, battlefield grants and easements, partnership initiatives, and the celebrations of the 40th anniversary of the easement program as well as the Preservation Act. Finally, she highlighted some of the items on the day's agenda.

Deputy Director Slusser presented the 2007 state work plan to the Boards, and with a motion from Ms. Lee and a second from Ms. Moore, the SRB voted to support the work plan. Then with a motion from Mr. Butler and a second from Ms. McCoy the HRB also voted to support the plan.

The register section of the meeting began with Ms. Andrus who presented the following nominations for the Capital Region.

1. Carver Residential Historic District, Boundary Increase, City of Richmond, #127-0822
2. Robert E. Lee Statue, City of Richmond, #127-0181
3. Manchester Residential and Commercial HD, Boundary Increase, City of Richmond, #127-0859
4. Pocahontas Island Historic District, City of Petersburg, #123-0114
5. Prehist. and Hist. Archaeological Resources and Architectural Res. at Bermuda Hundred, MPD, #020-5370
6. Town of Bermuda Hundred Historic District, Chesterfield County, #020-0064
7. Dale's Pale Archaeological District, Chesterfield County, #020-5371

The following comments were made:

Vice-Chair Lounsbury expressed his delight in the nomination for Pocahontas Island. Mr. Butler asked that the 1622 Indian uprising be mentioned in the Dale's Pale nomination, and added his continued desire to see the history sections of every nomination brought forward to the present day, regardless of the period of significance.

Mr. King, Chesterfield County Chairman of the Board of Supervisors, thanked everyone for the excellent documentation of history provided in the Pocahontas Island and Bermuda Hundred nominations. Mr. Stewart, Curator at the Pocahontas Island Museum, spoke of the property and its excellent history, and thanked everyone again. Mr. Selinger of Roper Bros. Lumber Co. asked whether the Roper Bros. property had been excluded from the final boundaries of the Pocahontas Island Historic District, and Mr. Wagner assured him the final nominated boundary did not include their property.

With a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Ms. Lee, all seven nominations from the Capital Region were approved by the SRB, and then with a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Ms. Murphy, all were approved for listing on the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR) by the HRB.

Next Ms. Bowman presented the following nominations from the Tidewater Region.

8. Makemie Monument Park, Accomack County, #001-0112
9. Marriott School, King and Queen County, #049-5010
10. Mount Sinai Baptist Church, City of Suffolk, #133-5249
11. Phoebus Historic District, City of Hampton, #114-5002
12. Tynes, Robert, House, Isle of Wight County, #046-0002
13. Whitehall Tavern, James City County, #047-0041
14. Willowdale, Accomack County, #001-062

The following comments were made:

Ms. Murphy asked the future of the Willowdale property and Ms. Bowman explained the current owners desire to restore the property. Ms. Jackson, an adjacent owner to the Marriott School, expressed her objection to the listing and noted her concern for future traffic surrounding the school as a cultural center. Mr. Green, Commonwealth Architects, spoke of the plans for the building and offered contact information to Mr. and Mrs. Jackson for future questions and concerns. He also urged them to contact the county, as the school is a community project, and he offered those contacts as well.

With a motion from Ms. Moore and a second from Ms. Lee, all seven nominations from the Tidewater Region were approved by the SRB, and then with a motion from Mr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Murphy, all were approved for listing on the VLR by the HRB.

Ms. McRae presented the following nomination for the Roanoke Region.

15. Pleasant View, Bedford County, #009-0207

With a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Ms. Moore, Pleasant View was approved by the SRB. Then with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Ms. Evans, the HRB approved Pleasant View for listing on the VLR.

Finally, Mr. Edwards presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

16. George Chrisman House, Rockingham County, #082-0136

17. Homestead Dairy Barns, Bath County, #008-5026
18. John Gunnell House, Fairfax County, #029-5525
19. Kite Mansion, Rockingham County, #082-5408
20. Locust Grove, Loudoun County, #286-5017
21. Longs Chapel, Rockingham County, #082-5264
22. Maury School, City of Fredericksburg, #111-0009-0014
23. Sleepy Hollow Farm, Loudoun County, #053-0273
24. Temple Hall, Loudoun County, #053-0303
25. The Yard, Bath County, #008-0135

The following comments were made:

Mr. Butler mentioned the curious “amateur” architecture of Mr. Kite and Mr. Braymer asked of the future plans for the Kite Mansion. Mr. Butler also discussed the agricultural practices mentioned in several of the nominations and said the lines between “Quakers” and “Planters,” western and eastern Virginia, were not always so clear. Mr. Jenkins, owner of Longs Chapel, expressed his appreciation for the consideration and listing of Longs Chapel and introduced Mrs. Jones, who also expressed her appreciation.

With a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Ms. Moore, the ten nominations for the Northern Region were approved by the SRB, and with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Mr. Braymer they were approved by the HRB for listing on the VLR. Finally, with a motion from Ms. Moore and a second from Ms. Lee, the Boards adjourned for lunch until 1:15 p.m. for the separate afternoon sessions.

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Chair Thompson brought the HRB back to order just before 1:30 p.m. and Ms. Archer presented the following Highway Markers for approval.

1. Pvt. Benjamin B. Levy, Glendale, Charles City County
2. Charles Fenton Mercer, Town of Leesburg, Loudoun County
3. Point of Honor, City of Lynchburg
4. Loudoun Heights Clash, Loudoun Heights, Loudoun County
5. Fearnought, City of Emporia
6. Carter Hall (Replacement), Clarke County

Ms. Murphy and Mr. Braymer asked if a grammarian sat on the editorial committee for the marker texts and indicated the texts should be reviewed a final time. Mr. Butler said he was pleased to see use of an active voice in most of the texts, as history remains active. Then with a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Ms. McCoy all six markers were approved.

Ms. Tune presented the following easements which had been executed since the June Board meeting.

1. First Day of Chancellorsville, Lick Run, Spotsylvania County
2. Phoenix Bank, Suffolk, (SAT Grant easement)
3. Stratford Hall, Westmoreland Co., 5.52 acres (SAT Grant easement)
4. Four Mile Tree, Surry Co., (co-grantee with VOF)
5. Hill Property, Hanover County (American Battlefields Protection grant)
6. Shield Property, Hanover County (American Battlefields Protection Program Grant)

Ms. Tune provided updates on old business, including the Elk Hill development proposal, and then continued by presenting the following easements for consideration.

1. 343, 345, and 347 South Laurel Street, Oregon Hill H.D., Richmond
2. Shirley Plantation, Charles City County
3. Burgh Westra, Gloucester County
4. The Meadows, Washington, Rappahannock County
5. Fisher’s Hill, Shenandoah National Battlefield (VLCF and NPS Grant)
6. Brema, Fluvanna County

With a motion from Mr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Murphy the first six easements were approved.

Chair Thompson excused himself, and Ms. Tune presented the Tuckahoe easement for consideration. With a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. McCoy, the final 20 acres of Tuckahoe in Goochland County was approved.

Chair Thompson returned and thanked everyone for the continued work to put all of Tuckahoe under easement, and then asked for an update on the easement policy document. Ms. Tune planned to have the final draft to the Board for the December meeting. With a motion from Mr. Butler and a second from Ms. Evans, the Historic Resources Board adjourned.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Vice-Chair Lounsbury brought the SRB to order around 1:15 p.m. in the Collections Study Room of the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and endorsement of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Ann Alexander (b), Laurant Lee (b), Carl Lounsbury (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Ann Andrus (s), Camille Bowman (s), Bob Carter (s), David Edwards (s), Joanie Evans (s), Susan Smead (s), Kelly Spradley-Kurowski (s), and Marc Wagner(s)

Guests (from sign in sheet): James and Susan Pates (Elmhurst), Bryan Green (Chamberlayne Gardens), Frank Kormann (Chamberlayne Gardens), Jonathan Bell (Chamberlayne Gardens), David Sa'adah (Woodlawn Friends Meetinghouse), Algeria Tate (Howland Chapel School Teacher's Cottage)

Preliminary Information Applications

All proposals were endorsed, except where noted, with the following comments:

1. Chamberlayne Garden Apartments, City of Richmond, #127-6182, Criteria A and C
Discussion was undertaken of the form and content of the upcoming MPD to support the PIF. The board asked for discussion of architectural quality, as well as FHA context and history.
2. Elmhurst, City of Fredericksburg, DHR File Number 111-5267
The Board recommended ending the POS with the end of the dairy operation on the property, and suggested that a nomination would need to address in depth the business part of the dairy operation for Criterion A, as all outbuildings had been demolished by previous owners.
3. Woodlawn Friends Meeting House, Fairfax County, DHR File Number 029-0172
The Board recommended Criteria Cons. A: A religious property deriving primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance and the church continues to be used as a Friends meeting house.
4. Howland School Teachers Cottage, Northumberland County, DHR File Number 066-0098
The Board expressed support for the Cottage's proposed move, with the stipulation that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Moved Buildings be followed.
5. Currie House, Town of Blacksburg, #150-5045, Criterion C, Criterion Consideration G
Mr. Wagner informed the committee that discussion of the Currie House would be postponed.
6. Dressler-Vance House, City of Covington, #107-5177, Criterion C
The Board concurred with the staff's recommendation that the house was **not individually eligible**, though agreed to consider a historic district if RRPO staff thought this was a viable option.
7. Home Farm, Loudoun County, DHR File Number 053-5388
The Board requested refinement of the start date of the POS, to a later date than the one listed in the PIF.
8. Longmoor, Loudoun County, DHR File Number 053-5594
9. Larkey-East House, Scott County, DHR File Number 084-5291
10. Olive Branch Baptist Church and Cemetery, Bedford County, DHR File Number 009-0135
The Board concurred with eligibility, noting that Criterion A would be of key importance in a nomination.
11. Bel Aire, Albemarle County, DHR File Number 002-0001
12. Crewe Town Hall, Nottoway County, DHR File Number 203-0020
13. DeJarnette Tavern, Halifax County, DHR File Number 041-0067
14. Forest Hill, Amherst County, DHR File Number 005-0108
15. Fry's Spring Service Station, City of Charlottesville, DHR File Number 104-0061
16. Rose Hill, Albemarle County, DHR File Number 002-0163
The Board requested that Criterion B be added to the nomination for the association of Susanne Massie, and that the entire property be considered, possibly as a district.
17. O.H.P. Tanner House, Mecklenburg County, DHR File Number 058-0048
The Board requested that the starting date of the POS be pushed forward approximately 30 years, to account for a later construction date for the house, and that a forthcoming nomination probably should not include mention of the resource as a courthouse.